Korespondensi untuk journal : "Probe Vehicle Lane Identification for Queue Length Estimation at Intersections"

Journal of Intelligent Transportation Systems: Technology, Planning, and Operations - Manuscript ID GITS-2016-0019 has been submitted online

Inbox ×

akhattak@utk.edu via manuscriptcentral.com

to me, sromp001

Sun, Feb 7, 2016, 2:44 PM

07-Feb-2016

Dear Dr Rompis:

Your manuscript entitled "Probe Vehicle Lane Identification for Queue Length Estimation at Intersections" has been successfully submitted online and is presently being given full consideration for publication in Journal of Intelligent Transportation Systems: Technology, Planning, and Operations.

Your manuscript ID is GITS-2016-0019.

Please mention the above manuscript ID in all future correspondence or when calling the office for questions. If there are any changes in your street address or e-mail address, please log in to ScholarOne Manuscripts at https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/jits and edit your user information as appropriate.

You can also view the status of your manuscript at any time by checking your Author Center after logging in to https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/jits.

Thank you for submitting your manuscript to Journal of Intelligent Transportation Systems: Technology, Planning, and Operations.

Sincerely,
Journal of Intelligent Transportation Systems: Technology, Planning, and Operations Editorial Office

/.

Journal of Intelligent Transportation Systems: Technology, Planning, and Operations -- GITS-2016-0019 Assigned to Associate Editor Inbox ×

bpark@virginia.edu via manuscriptcentral.com

to me, sromp001

Mon, Feb 29, 2016, 12:15 PM

28-Feb-2016

Dear Dr Semuel Rompis:

Thank you for your submission to Journal of Intelligent Transportation Systems: Technology, Planning, and Operations. Your manuscript, entitled "Probe Vehicle Lane Identification for Queue Length Estimation at Intersections" has been assigned to an Associate Editor for handling. You may find the Associate Editor's information below. Please feel free to contact the assigned Associate Editor if you have any questions.

Associate Editor: Professor Brian Park
Email: bpark@virginia.edu

Sincerely,
Journal of Intelligent Transportation Systems: Technology, Planning, and Operations Editorial Office

Reply | Reply all | Forward

Re: Journal of Intelligent Transportation Systems: Technology, Planning, and Operations -- GITS-2016-0019 Assigned to Associate Editor

Semuel Rompis <semrompis@fulbrightmail.org>
to bpark

Fri, Mar 18, 2016, 6:00 PM

Dear Professor Brian Park,
Thank you for your email, looking forward to hearing from you.

Regards,
Sem

On Mon, Feb 29, 2016 at 12:15 PM, <bpark@virginia.edu> wrote:

28-Feb-2016

Dear Dr Semuel Rompis:

Thank you for your submission to Journal of Intelligent Transportation Systems: Technology, Planning, and Operations. Your manuscript, entitled "Probe Vehicle Lane Identification for Queue Length Estimation at Intersections" has been assigned to an Associate Editor for handling. You may find the Associate Editor's information below. Please feel free to contact the assigned Associate Editor if you have any questions.

Associate Editor: Professor Brian Park
Email: bpark@virginia.edu

Sincerely,
Journal of Intelligent Transportation Systems: Technology, Planning, and Operations Editorial Office

Journal of Intelligent Transportation Systems: Technology, Planning, and Operations - Decision on Manuscript ID GITS-2016-0019

Inbox ×

Journal of Intelligent Transportation Systems: Technology, Planning, and Operations <onbehalfof+bpa... Sat, Jul 9, 2016, 7:23 AM

to me, sromp001

08-Jul-2016

Dear Dr Rompis:

Your manuscript entitled "Probe Vehicle Lane Identification for Queue Length Estimation at Intersections", which you submitted to Journal of Intelligent Transportation Systems: Technology, Planning, and Operations, has been reviewed. The reviewer comments are included at the bottom of this letter.

The reviewer(s) would like to see some revisions made to your manuscript before publication. Therefore, I invite you to respond to the reviewer(s)' comments and revise your manuscript.

When you revise your manuscript please highlight the changes you make in the manuscript by using the track changes mode in MS Word or by using bold or coloured text.

To start the revision, please click on the link below:

https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/jits?URL_MASK=50f1773236a248a488a5a1ba4679dd73

This will direct you to the first page of your revised manuscript. Please enter your responses to the comments made by the reviewer(s) in the space provided. You can use this space to document any changes you made to the original manuscript. Please be as specific as possible in your response to the reviewer(s).

revise your manuscript.

When you revise your manuscript please highlight the changes you make in the manuscript by using the track changes mode in MS Word or by using bold or coloured text.

To start the revision, please click on the link below:

https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/jits?URL_MASK=50f1773236a248a488a5a1ba4679dd73

This will direct you to the first page of your revised manuscript. Please enter your responses to the comments made by the reviewer(s) in the space provided. You can use this space to document any changes you made to the original manuscript. Please be as specific as possible in your response to the reviewer(s).

This link will remain active until you have submitted your revised manuscript. If you begin a revision and intend to finish it at a later time, please note that your draft will appear in the "Revised Manuscripts in Draft" queue in your Author Center.

IMPORTANT: Your original files are available to you when you upload your revised manuscript. Please delete any redundant files before completing the submission.

Because we are trying to facilitate timely publication of manuscripts submitted to Journal of Intelligent Transportation Systems: Technology, Planning, and Operations, your revised manuscript should be uploaded within two months.

Once again, thank you for submitting your manuscript to Journal of Intelligent Transportation Systems: Technology, Planning, and Operations and I look forward to receiving your revision.

Sincerely,
Professor Park
Associate Editor, Journal of Intelligent Transportation Systems: Technology, Planning, and Operations
bpark@virginia.edu

Sincerely,
Professor Park
Associate Editor, Journal of Intelligent Transportation Systems: Technology, Planning, and Operations
bpark@virginia.edu

Reviewer(s)' Comments to Author:

Reviewer: 1

Comments to the Author
The proposed method for identifying lanes of probe vehicle is interesting but challenge. Overall, the description of paper is clear and I have the following comments for the authors to consider.

Figure 1 is confusion. I assume the authors attempt to show the growth of the queue (or shockwave propagation) in each lane at the same time. It would be better to show x-axis (time) vs. each lane rather than overlap them.

Please update the caption of the illustration for trajectory data in 5.2.

Imagining that the arrivals of two vehicles are identical (at least for the first few vehicles) in each lane, the proposed naïve method will obviously lead to biased classification as the individual queuing shockwave speed will overlap each other (For example, what if the red dots and blue dots in Figure 4 overlap?). The shockwave speed boundary (Bc) as well as the clustering procedure denoted by equations (3) and (4) will be useless in such a scenario.

When discussing the missing data cycles, why the queue length estimation for current cycle can still use the estimate from the previous cycle? Such estimate might be significantly biased. The arrivals of two cycles can be totally different. For example, the upstream is blocked due to an incident and few (probe) vehicles arrive at the second cycle.

I understand that the authors tried to find the shockwave speed distributions for each lane by using training data. It should be noted that mostly likely you cannot use

the second cycle.

I understand that the authors tried to find the shockwave speed distributions for each lane by using training data. It should be noted that mostly likely you cannot use a single distribution function (e.g., equations 6 and 9) to represent all traffic conditions. In other words, the PDFs will change when the arrival rates of each lane change.

In Figure 7, it looks strange to me that there were notable fluctuations for the precisions when the probability of SQL is very high. Please carefully explain why this happened.

Another major issue will be the calculated individual shockwave speed. Theoretically, if the coordinates of each vehicle is accurate, there will be no issue according to the authors' equation. However, there will be unavoidably errors in calculating theses individual shockwave speed if you are using the actual GPS data. Remember all the present analysis were done based on the data collected in Vissim simulation model. The simulated trajectories (coordinates) are absolutely better (clearer) than what you would be able to get through GPS receivers or Smartphones. That means your coordinates obtained by simulation model would certainly be better than probes (based on GPS) to find the different slopes (shockwaves) for vehicles in each lane. The coordinate accuracy of the probe vehicles will be a great challenge for using the proposed method in field.

The paper illustrates the cases of two lane. What if there are multiple lanes, in particular, with shared use lanes?

Reviewer: 2

Comments to the Author
The primary focus of the paper was to identify lane positions of probe vehicles at isolated intersections. The authors compared different methods and concluded that the Bivariate Mixture model clustering approach which considers both shockwave speed and the distance between probe vehicles and stop bar outperformed other methods that consider only one parameter. In general the paper is well written and reasonably easy to follow. However, several concerns still need to be addressed before the paper can be published.

1. My major concern lies in the use of traffic simulation data for this problem. The whole study rests on the empirical analyses of the simulation data generated by VISSIM. It is not clear to what extent the proposed clustering method can be used to identify lane positions in the real world in which drivers' behavior is much more

The paper illustrates the cases of two lane. What if there are multiple lanes, in particular, with shared use lanes?

Reviewer: 2

Comments to the Author
The primary focus of the paper was to identify lane positions of probe vehicles at isolated intersections. The authors compared different methods and concluded that the Bivariate Mixture model clustering approach which considers both shockwave speed and the distance between probe vehicles and stop bar outperformed other methods that consider only one parameter. In general the paper is well written and reasonably easy to follow. However, several concerns still need to be addressed before the paper can be published.

1. My major concern lies in the use of traffic simulation data for this problem. The whole study rests on the empirical analyses of the simulation data generated by VISSIM. It is not clear to what extent the proposed clustering method can be used to identify lane positions in the real world in which drivers' behavior is much more unpredictable and stochastic as compared with those in the simulated environment;.

2. The authors deal with a greatly simplified situation, i.e. an isolated intersections with two lanes (SQL and LQL) and during under-saturated conditions. It is not clear how and whether the proposed method can be applied to more prevailing conditions which are much more complex in nature;

3. In figure 6 it looks like the prediction accuracy of lane positions is generally not so sensitive to the penetration rate of probe vehicles when the Bivariate Mixture model clustering method is used. For the SQL scenario it looks like the prediction accuracy may even decrease slightly as the penetration rate increases. The finding is very wired and counter-intuitive. Also it looks like the prediction accuracy can reach up to 80%-90% even when the penetration rate is very low (<10%). The finding is quite unreasonable and merits further exploration;

4. Numerous methods have been proposed for estimating queue length given probe vehicle data. These methods need to be discussed in greater details in the literature review part, and the authors might consider citing the most recent paper by Comert (Queue length estimation from probe vehicles at isolated intersections: Estimators for primary parameters, European Journal of Operational Research Vol 252, Issue 2, 16 July 2016, Pages 502–521). To me it is not so clear why the authors consider the LWR method only.

Reminder: Your Revision for Journal of Intelligent Transportation Systems: Technology, Planning, and Operations is due in one month

Inbox ×

Journal of Intelligent Transportation Systems: Technology, Planning, and Operations <onbehalfof+akh...   Mon, Aug 8, 2016, 12:53 PM

to me, sromp001 ▾

08-Aug-2016

Dear Dr Semuel Rompis:

Recently, you received a decision on Manuscript ID GITS-2016-0019, entitled "Probe Vehicle Lane Identification for Queue Length Estimation at Intersections." This email is simply a reminder that your revision is due in one month.

To start the revision, please click on the link below:

https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/jits?URL_MASK=5e92cf4eb35b4569ad8d16db7eb92a0e

This will direct you to the first page of your revised manuscript in your Author Center. The manuscript and decision letter are located here also.

This link will remain active until you have submitted your revised manuscript. If you have already begun a revision, you can click on the link to continue your revision. Please note that your draft will appear in the "Revised Manuscripts in Draft" queue in your Author Center.

Please contact the Editorial Office if you are unable to submit within this time.

Sincerely,
Asad Khattak
Journal of Intelligent Transportation Systems: Technology, Planning, and Operations Editorial Office

Journal of Intelligent Transportation Systems: Technology, Planning, and Operations - Manuscript ID GITS-2016-0019.R1 has been submitted online

Inbox ×

Journal of Intelligent Transportation Systems: Technology, Planning, and Operations <onbehalfof+akha...   Tue, Aug 23, 2016, 8:31 PM

to me, sromp001

23-Aug-2016

Dear Dr Rompis:

Your manuscript entitled "Probe Vehicle Lane Identification for Queue Length Estimation at Intersections" has been successfully submitted online and is presently being given full consideration for publication in Journal of Intelligent Transportation Systems: Technology, Planning, and Operations.

Your manuscript ID is GITS-2016-0019.R1.

Please mention the above manuscript ID in all future correspondence or when calling the office for questions. If there are any changes in your street address or e-mail address, please log in to ScholarOne Manuscripts at https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/jits and edit your user information as appropriate.

You can also view the status of your manuscript at any time by checking your Author Center after logging in to https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/jits.

Thank you for submitting your manuscript to Journal of Intelligent Transportation Systems: Technology, Planning, and Operations.

Sincerely,
Journal of Intelligent Transportation Systems: Technology, Planning, and Operations Editorial Office

Journal of Intelligent Transportation Systems: Technology, Planning, and Operations <onbehalfof+b... Mon, Feb 20, 2017, 2:51AM

to me, sromp001

19-Feb-2017

Dear Dr Rompis:

Ref: Probe Vehicle Lane Identification for Queue Length Estimation at Intersections

Our reviewers have now considered your paper and have recommended publication in Journal of Intelligent Transportation Systems: Technology, Planning, and Operations. We are pleased to accept your paper in its current form which will now be forwarded to the publisher for copy editing and typesetting. The reviewer comments are included at the bottom of this letter.

Thank you for your contribution to Journal of Intelligent Transportation Systems: Technology, Planning, and Operations and we look forward to receiving further submissions from you.

Sincerely,
Professor Park
Associate Editor, Journal of Intelligent Transportation Systems: Technology, Planning, and Operations
bpark@virginia.edu

Reviewer(s)' Comments to Author:

Reviewer: 1

Comments to the Author

Gmail

journal of intelligent transportation systems: technology, planning, ar

Active

FULBRIGHT

Compose

Mail 99+

Chat

Spaces

Meet

Inbox 1,354
Starred
Snoozed
Important
Sent
Drafts 19
Categories
Social 142
Updates 734
Forums
Promotions 362
More

Labels +
Follow up
Misc
Priority

Journal of Intelligent Transportation Systems: Technology, Planning, and Operations

Inbox ×

Journal of Intelligent Transportation Systems: Technology, Planning, and Operations <onbehalfof+akh...   Mon, Feb 20, 2017, 2:53 AM

to me, sromp001, Byungkyu(Brian)Park

Journal of Intelligent Transportation Systems: Technology, Planning, and Operations

19-Feb-2017

GITS-2016-0019.R1 - Probe Vehicle Lane Identification for Queue Length Estimation at Intersections

Dear Dr Semuel Rompis:

Congratulations on acceptance of your paper. I want to sincerely thank Dr. Park for handling the paper.

I request the following updates/changes, before submitting your paper for production:

1) Update the literature review, citing any relevant papers that have appeared in the Journal of Intelligent Transportation Systems. To conduct a quick search, please visit:

http://www.tandfonline.com/toc/gits20/current

2) Please ensure the abstract covers the objectives, methods, key results, and implications, within 250 words.

3) Please provide a final paper following the Journal of ITS guidelines, with a Title page containing authors affiliation and e-mail address (page 1), followed by

http://www.tandfonline.com/toc/gits20/current

2) Please ensure the abstract covers the objectives, methods, key results, and implications, within 250 words.

3) Please provide a final paper following the Journal of ITS guidelines, with a Title page containing authors affiliation and e-mail address (page 1), followed by Abstract and Key Words (page 2), and full text, all in the same document. Ensure that you have followed the journal "instructions for authors" in preparing your final manuscript.
http://www.tandfonline.com/action/authorSubmission?journalCode=gits20&page=instructions#.VzHWzUcuwSY

Please submit the final version directly to me by ???? or before via email in Microsoft WORD format.

After I pass on your manuscript to the publisher, you will receive proofs for checking, and instructions for transfer of copyright in due course. The publisher also requests that proofs are checked through the publisher's tracking system and returned within 48 hours of receipt.

Thank you for your contribution to JITS.

Asad Khattak, Ph.D.
Editor, Journal of Intelligent Transportation Systems

Gmail

in:sent

Active

FULBRIGHT

569 of 1,590

Re: FW: Journal of Intelligent Transportation Systems: Technology, Planning, and Operations

Compose

Inbox 1,354
Starred
Snoozed
Important
Sent
Drafts 19
Categories
Social 142
Updates 734
Forums
Promotions 362
More

Semuel Rompis <semrompis@fulbrightmail.org>   Sun, Feb 26, 2017, 3:35 AM
to akhattak, Semuel, Mecit, Filmon

Dear Dr. Khattak,
Thank you for the email.
Attached is the final version of the accepted paper. As request, the literature review has been updated by citing several papers from Journal of Intelligent Transportation Systems, the abstract contain less than 250 words and I have tried my best to follow the journal "instructions for authors" in preparing the final manuscript.
Thank you.

Sem

On Mon, Feb 20, 2017 at 2:58 AM, Journal of Intelligent Transportation Systems: Technology, Planning, and Operations <onbehalfof+akhattak+utk.edu@manuscriptcentral.com> wrote:

Please send it to me by March 1, 2017.

Journal of Intelligent Transportation Systems: Technology, Planning, and Operations

19-Feb-2017

GITS-2016-0019.R1 - Probe Vehicle Lane Identification for Queue Length Estimation at Intersections

Dear Dr Semuel Rompis:

Labels

Follow up
Misc
Priority